

Recommended Draft Policy ARIN-2022-12: Direct Assignment Language Update

Douglas Camin and Leif Sawyer



Problem Statement

Current Text (20 March 2024)

As a result of ARIN's fee harmonization direct assignments are no longer being utilized within ARIN databases therefore language around that has been deprecated and should be modernized and aligned with current ARIN practices.

Policy Statement

Section 2.5 - Update definition of Allocation and Assignment to reflect current practice.

FROM:

"Allocation - IP addresses delegated to an organization directly by ARIN for the purpose of subsequent distribution by the recipient organization to other parties.

Assignment - IP addresses delegated to an organization directly by ARIN for the exclusive use of the recipient organization."

TO:

"Allocation - **A block of IP addresses issued from ARIN directly to customers. These IP addresses may be further reassigned or reallocated accordingly.**

Assignment – **This term is no longer used to describe IP addresses issued by ARIN."**

Policy Statement

Section 2.6 - Change “receiving assignments of” to “issued.”

FROM:

“2.6 End User

An end-user is an organization **receiving assignments of** IP addresses exclusively for use in its operational networks.”

TO:

“2.6 End User

An end-user is an organization **issued** IP addresses exclusively for use in its operational networks.”

Policy Statement

Section 2.8 - Change "allocated or assigned" to "issued."

FROM:

"2.8. Registration Services Agreement (RSA)
Number resources allocated or assigned by ARIN under these policies are subject to a contractual agreement between ARIN and the resource holder. Throughout this document, any and all forms of this agreement, past or future, are simply referred to as the Registration Services Agreement (RSA)."

TO:

"2.8. Registration Services Agreement (RSA)
Internet number resources **issued** by ARIN under these policies are subject to a contractual agreement between ARIN and the resource holder. Throughout this document, any and all forms of this agreement, past or future, are simply referred to as the Registration Services Agreement (RSA)."

Policy Statement

Section 3.6.3 - Change paragraph 1 text

FROM:

"This policy applies to every Organization that has a direct assignment, direct allocation, or AS number from ARIN"

TO:

"This policy applies to every Organization that has Internet number resources issued by ARIN"

Policy Statement

Section 3.6.3 Continued:

RESULT:

“This policy applies to every Organization that has **Internet number resources issued by** ARIN (or one of its predecessor registries) or a reallocation from an upstream ISP. This includes but is not limited to upstream ISPs and their downstream ISP customers (as defined by NRPM 2.5 and 2.6), but not reassignments made to their downstream end user customers.”

Policy Statement

Section 4.2.2 - Replace text as follows:

FROM:

“All ISP organizations without direct assignments or allocations from ARIN qualify for an initial allocation of up to a /22, subject to ARIN’s minimum allocation size.

All ISP organizations without direct allocations, direct assignments, re-allocations or reassignments automatically qualify for a /24. These organizations are exempt from requirements of showing the efficient utilization of previously held IPv4 space. These organizations may qualify for a larger than a /24 by documenting how the requested allocation will be utilized within the request size specified in 4.2.4.3.

ISPs holding re-allocations and/or reassignments must show the efficient utilization of their resources consistent with the requirements in sections 4.2.3 and 4.2.4. ”

TO:

“All ISP organizations without any IPv4 addresses from ARIN automatically qualify for an initial allocation of a /24. ISPs providing a 24-month utilization plan for the request size specified may receive up to a /22. ISPs holding re-allocations and/or reassignments must show the efficient utilization of their resources consistent with the requirements in sections 4.2.3 and 4.2.4. ”



Policy Statement

Section 4.3.2 - Change paragraph 1 text

FROM:

“End-user organizations without **direct assignments or allocations** from ARIN qualify for an initial assignment of ARIN’s minimum assignment size.”

TO:

“End-user organizations without **an IPv4 allocation** from ARIN qualify for an initial allocation of ARIN’s minimum allocation size.”

Policy Statement

Section 6.5.8 - Change section title

FROM:

“Direct Assignments from ARIN to End-user Organizations”

TO:

“End-user Allocations”

Policy Statement

Section 8.5.4 - Change section text

FROM:

"Organizations without **direct assignments or allocations** from ARIN qualify for transfer of an initial IPv4 block of ARIN's minimum transfer size."

TO:

"Organizations without **an IPv4 allocation** from ARIN qualify for transfer of an initial IPv4 **allocation** of ARIN's minimum transfer size."

Policy Statement

Section 8.5.6 - Change section text

FROM:

“Organizations with **direct assignments or allocations** from ARIN must have efficiently utilized at least 50% of their cumulative IPv4 address blocks in order to receive additional IPv4 addresses. This includes all IPv4 space reassigned to their customers.”

TO:

“Organizations with **an IPv4 allocation** from ARIN must have efficiently utilized at least 50% of their cumulative IPv4 address blocks in order to receive additional IPv4 addresses. This includes all IPv4 space reallocated and/or reassigned to their customers.”

AC Assessment of Conformance with the Principles of Internet Number Resource Policy

Draft Policy ARIN-2022-12: Direct Assignment Language Update, conforms to the principles of the ARIN Policy Development Process. This draft policy is found to be fair, impartial, and technically sound. Based on community feedback and AC discussion we motion to move ARIN 2022-12: Direct Assignment Language Update, to Recommended Draft. If adopted this policy aims to update the language of Number Policy Resource Manual to remove references to the deprecated term “assignment” and use the term “allocation,” which conforms with current ARIN business practices.



Recommended Draft Policy ARIN-2022-12: Direct Assignment Language Update

Action	Date
Proposal	25 July 2022
Draft Policy	23 August 2022
Revised	3 November 2022
Revised	20 March 2023
Revised	18 July 2023
Revised	2 August 2023
Revised	14 August 2023
Revised	5 September 2023
Revised	29 September 2023
Revised	1 February 2024
Revised	1 March 2024
Revised	20 March 2024
Recommended Draft Policy	21 May 2024

Staff and Legal Review (15 March 2024)

Staff Understanding

We understand that the intent of this Recommended Draft Policy is to update the definition of the terms “Allocation” and “Assignment” in section 2.5 of the Number Resource Policy Manual. Staff recommends that proposed definitions be changed to the following to be more precise and clearer as to the meaning of these terms in reference to ARIN practice and the policies in the NRPM.



Staff and Legal Review (cont.)

In Section 2.5, update the definition of Allocation and Assignment to reflect current practice.

- Allocation – the term allocation refers to a block of IP addresses issued from ARIN directly to customers. These IP addresses may be further reassigned or reallocated accordingly.
- Assignment – this term is no longer used to describe IP addresses issued by ARIN.

Staff and Legal Review (cont.)

Staff suggests that consistent use of the term Allocation when the definition of Allocation is intended, instead of synonyms or other forms of the word, such as “allocated,” will add clarity and precision to the text. For similar reasons, staff recommends eventually making these updates to the entire NRPM.

Implementable as Written? Yes

Impact on ARIN Registry Operations and Services: None



Staff and Legal Review (cont.)

Legal Review: There is no legal objection to proposed language, but as this is the first time that the terminology has been reviewed in many years, Legal notes that use of the term “issued” rather than “allocated or assigned” in Section 2.8 would make the language consistent with the terminology used in the Registration Services Agreement (RSA).

Implementation Timeframe Estimate: Three months

Implementation Requirements:

- Staff training
- Updates to public documentation

Proposal/Draft Policy Text Assessed: 1 March 2024

Policy Impact

This draft policy could potentially harmonize the Number Resource Policy Manual and Registration Services Plan Fee Schedule.

The term "issued" currently used in the Registration Services Agreement (RSA) would match the proposed changes in this draft policy.

Community Feedback

ARIN 52 Feedback

Changing definitions of "allocation" and "assignment" was not supported

- Revised to leave primary definitions

Concern that some language changed impact from "no allocation" to "no IP addresses"

- Reviewed text and updated as appropriate

Community Feedback

Public Policy Mailing List feedback actively solicited in February 2024

- Received supportive comments with language recommendations that were incorporated in 1 March revision
- Received comment that definitions should be changed to reflect a layperson's definition.
 - Revised with new Staff and Legal suggestion for definitions.

Community Feedback

ARIN 53 Feedback – April 2024

- Received supportive comments.
- Clarification questions were asked that were answered by staff.

Questions for the Community



Are you in favor or against implementing this Recommended Draft Policy as written?