Recommended Draft Policy ARIN-2016-6 Eliminate HD-Ratio from NRPM

David Farmer

Problem Statement

- HD-Ratio has become an anachronism in the NRPM
- It creates confusion regarding recommended prefix sizes for IPv6
  - **Resulting in a belief that ARIN measures IPv6 use efficiency in /56 units**
  - **ARIN policy has always allowed /48 prefixes for all end-sites without need for further justification**
  - **More restrictive choices, like using /56s, are permitted as well**
  - **This proposal does not change that, it simply attempts to eliminate this confusion**

#ARIN38

Problem Statement - Continued

- The last remaining references to HD-Ratio are contained in the Community Networks policy (Section 6.5.9)
- This policy replaces 6.5.9 with new text incorporating current End User policy by reference
  - **rather than using HD-Ratio**
- While this entails a substantial rewrite to the Community Networks policy, it should not have a negative impact
  - **If anything, current End User policy allows larger IPv6 assignments than HD-Ratio would**

Policy Statement

Replace section 6.5.9 in its entirety as follows:

6.5.9 Community Network Assignments

While community networks would normally be considered to be ISP type organizations under existing ARIN criteria, they tend to operate on much tighter budgets and often depend on volunteer labor. As a result, they tend to be much smaller and more communal in their organization rather than provider/customer relationships of commercial ISPs. This section seeks to provide policy that is more friendly to those environments by allowing them to use end-user criteria.

Policy Statement - Continued

6.5.9.1 Qualification Criteria

To qualify under this section, a community network must demonstrate to ARIN's satisfaction that it meets the definition of a community network under section 2.11 of the NRPM.

Policy Statement - Continued

6.5.9.2 Receiving Resources

Once qualified under this section, a community network shall be treated as an end-user assignment for all ARIN purposes (both policy and fee structure) unless or until the board adopts a specific more favorable fee structure for community networks.

Community networks shall be eligible under this section only for IPv6 resources and the application process and use of those resources shall be governed by the existing end-user policy contained in section 6.5.8 et. seq.

Community networks seeking other resources shall remain subject to the policies governing those resources independent of their election to use this policy for IPv6 resources.

Policy Statement - Continued

Delete section 2.8 — This section is non-operative and conflicts with the definitions of utilization contained in current policies

Utilization (IPv6) Definition

Delete section 2.9 — This section is no longer operative

HD-Ratio Definition

Delete section 6.7 — This section is no longer applicable

Appendix A: HD-Ratio Table

Staff and Legal Summary

- Legal Assessment
  - **The policy does not appear to create any material legal issue**
- Staff Assessment
  - **This policy language aligns with current practice of ARIN staff, ARIN staff does not currently use HD-Ratio**
  - **This policy could be implemented as written and would have minimal resource impact**

Community Network Options
Summarized from Staff Comments

- As end-user
  - **This is the default classification for a community network requesting IPv6 under NRPM 6.5.9**

- As end-user with Registration Services Plan
  - **All end-users, including community networks, may subscribe to an ARIN Registration Services Plan https://www.arin.net/fees/fee_schedule.html - end_users**

- As ISP/LIR
  - **Many community networks can qualify as an ISP for IPv6 under NRPM Section 6.5.2 (and subsections) if requested**

#ARIN38

Support

- Eliminating HD-Ratio seems non-controversial
  - **No concerns or objections have been raised**
  - **Overall there seems to be community support for this policy**

- This policy is the culmination of work that began with
  - **ARIN-2010-4: Rework of IPv6 allocation criteria**
  - **ARIN-2010-8: Rework of IPv6 assignment criteria**
  - **ARIN-2011-3: Better IPv6 Allocations for ISPs**

#ARIN38

Community Networks

- The primary goal of this policy is to Eliminate HD-Ratio
  - **Rewriting Community Networks is necessary to Eliminate HD-Ratio**
  - **An alternate option is to delete Community Networks rather than rewrite it**
- However, the community seems to support the rewrite

Discussion

- Do you support Eliminating HD-Ratio from the NRPM?
- Do you support the rewritten text for Community Networks?
- Do you have any concerns or objections?

ARIN 38

DALLAS | TX ★ 20-21 OCT 2016

Thank You

Alternate Policy Statement

Presented only if there is a lack of support for
the rewritten Community Networks section

ARIN 38
DALLAS | TX ★ 20-21 OCT 2016

Delete section 2.8 — This section is non-operative and conflicts with the definitions of utilization contained in current policies

Delete section 2.9 — This section is no longer operative

Delete section 6.7 — This section is no longer applicable

Delete section 6.5.9 — The alternative is to delete this section

Delete section 2.11 — If 6.5.9 is deleted, this section should be too