Draft Policy 2011-1

ARIN Inter-RIR Transfers

2011-1 - History

1. Origin: ARIN-prop-119 (Oct 2010)

2. AC Shepherds: Bill Darte, Robert Seastrom

3. AC selected as Draft Policy (Jan 2011)

4. Presented at ARIN 27 (San Juan)

5. Remained on AC's docket

6. Revised/current version: 22 Sep 2011

7. Text and assessment online & in Discussion Guide

   https://www.arin.net/policy/proposals/2011_1.html

2011-1 – Summary

This proposal would allow transfers of address space to and from the ARIN region as long as both RIRs agree to the transfer, and apply compatible, needs-based policies.

2011-1 – Status at other RIRs

APNIC – Adopted

LACNIC – Panel discussion at LACNIC 16 (Oct 2011)

2011-1 – Staff Assessment

Staff Comments: Issues/Concerns?

1. The proposed policy language is unclear, vague, and wide open for interpretation.

2. The phrase, "compatible, needs-based policies" is undefined. While many in the ARIN PPML community understand the intent of the phrase, it is important that policy text be clear and understandable to all.

3. The phrase, "which otherwise meet both RIR's policies" is also vague. Which policies must the transferor and transferee meet? The text should be revised to be precise to fully convey the author's intent.

4. Staff provided an outline of how the policy would be implemented.

5. Zone fragmentation, reverse DNS issues.

Implementation: Resource Impact? – Major (9-12 months)

– Careful coordination between RIRs on reverse addressing issues

– Updated guidelines and staff training

2011-1 – Legal Assessment

I suggest one major addition to this policy, which may be totally consistent with the drafter's intent. Currently, it is my understanding that ARIN policy does not permit transfers within the region unless the resources are covered by RSA or LRSA. The language of this section might properly be clarified to reinforce that resources not already under registration services agreement may not be transferred until ARIN has validated the correct resource holder.

2011-1 – PPML Discussion

- **38 posts by 12 people (5 in favor and 2 against)**

- "…this is not a perfect policy, but is another one of the IPv4 pragmatic policies that we need to pass, and move on."

- "Opposed. There is substantial need for IPv4 at every RIR. One is not more important than the other, so there should never be a policy permitting a transfer out."

- "…concerned with the staff report stating this was a major implementation. If a company decided to transfer out 1000 /24's to 1000 different companies that would be a lot of time/cost that the region would be burdened with."

Draft Policy 2011-1

ARIN Inter-RIR Transfers